DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 305 607 CS 009 604

AUTHOR Mujica, Maria
TITLE A Comparison of Miami Linguistic Readers and Holt Basic Reading Series.
PUB DATE May 89
NOTE 65p.; Master's of Arts Degree study, Kean College.
PUB TYPE Dissertations/Theses - Master Theses (042)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC03 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS Basal Reading; Comparative Analysis; Content Analysis; Primary Education; Reading Instruction; *Reading Materials; Textbook Content; *Vocabulary; *Word Recognition
IDENTIFIERS *Holt Basic Reading Series; *Miami Linguistic Readers

ABSTRACT

A study involved a comparison of the "Miami Linguistic Readers" and the "Holt Basic Reading Series." It was hypothesized that there is no difference between the "Miami Linguistic Readers" and the "Holt Basic Reading Series" in vocabulary load, word recognition, and comprehension requirements. An analysis of the results indicated that the "Holt Basic Reading Series" had the larger vocabulary load of the two series. In the area of word recognition, a difference was observed as to when specific skills were introduced in the two series. And in the area of comprehension, the "Miami Linguistic Readers" did not cover many of the skills found in typical basals. (Four tables of data are included, and 20 references are attached.) (Author/RAE)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED305607

A Comparison of Miami Linguistic Readers and Holt Basic Reading Series

by:

Maria Mujica

May 1989

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Maria Mujica

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

☐ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

CS005604

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Master's of Arts Degree.

ABSTRACT

This study involved a comparison of the Miami Linguistic Readers and the Holt Basic Reading Series. It was hypothesized that there is no difference between the Miami Linguistic Readers and Holt Basic Reading Series in vocabulary load, word recognition, and comprehension requirements.

An analysis of the results indicated that the Holt Basic Reading Series had the larger vocabulary load of the two series. In the area of word recognition, a difference was observed as to when specific skills were introduced in the two series. And in the area of comprehension, the Miami Linguistic Readers did not cover many of the skills found in typical basals.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my appreciation to Oscar, my husband for understanding, support, and help during the last year.

I would also like to express my deepest appreciation to my mother, Elsie, for caring for the baby every day while I attended classes, studied for comps, and worked on the thesis.

Also my brother, Hector, and any other family member who helped in any way. Thank you.

And finally my daughter, Ashley, who I spent very little time with the first year of her life, so I could complete my master's degree. I dedicate this paper to her.

Table of Contents

I. Abstract

II. Acknowledgement

III. List of Tables

IV. A Comparison of Miami Linguistic Readers and Holt Basic Reading Series:

	Page
Introduction	1
Hypothesis	5
Definitions	6
Assumptions	6
Limitations	7
Procedures	8
Results	10
Conclusions	33

V. Basal Readers: Related Research 37

VI. References 51

LIST OF TABLES

Tables	Page
I. Vocabulary Load - Comparison of Reading Skills	13
II. Word Recognition - Comparison of Reading Skills	15
III. Structural Analysis - Comparison of Reading Skills	21
IV. Comprehension - Comparison of Reading Skills	25

Are bilingual students who are making the change from the Miami Linguistic Readers to the Holt Basic Reading Series ready for the transition? Very often when these students enter into a monolingual classroom setting, they find themselves uncertain in many of the reading areas (i.e. vocabulary, comprehension). This uncertainty extends into the content area subjects as well. Their lack of reading skills prohibits a smooth transition.

Miami Linguistic Readers were originally developed to provide a breakthrough on the problem of teaching reading and language arts to children who are learning English as a second language (Aukerman, 1971). It is a linguistically-oriented program with an emphasis on listening and speaking.

The center of the language activitives, according to Aukerman, is "on the acquisition of patterns" and the techniques used are "those of drill." The students read with grammatically-controlled structures and patterns by use of drills. "The objective is to help the child learn to understand, speak, read, and write standard English" (Aukerman, 1971).

One of the deficiencies with the Miami Linguistic Series appears to be a low vocabulary load. This series does not

provide enough vocabulary development for the students. Aukerman (1971) states that the stories were constructed "with extreme limited vocabulary and controlled grammatical structure". For example, the first reader booklet, Biff and Tiff, uses only seven words.

Another limitation with the Miami Linguistic Series would appear to be the manner in which words are introduced. For instance, the verbs think, swim, and sit are expanded with the -ing ending. Aukerman (1971) mentioned that certain grammatical patterns, such as the doubling of the letter "t" to make the word sitting, is an "abstract concept of grammar". Many linguists agree that this concept should be eliminated during the early learning stages.

Students exiting the Miami Linguistic Readers and starting with the Holt Basic Readers exhibit frustration in many areas of reading. Many of the reading skills which make the Holt Basic Readers a total reading program are lacking in the Miami series.

The Holt Basic Reading Series is considered a "conventional basal" (Chall, 1967). This series includes materials which introduce sight vocabulary, reading for meaning, context clues, sentence meaning, word recognition, and

phonics/decoding skills. Dykstra (1968) made a similar basal category list when he compared four types of primary reading programs. The Holt Basic Reading Series is a typical basal reader which Chall (1967) calls in her book "conventional basal material".

Dykstra (1968) compared a conventional basal, i.e. Ginn, Scott Foresman, to that of a linguistic program. He mentioned that basal and linguistic treatments are conducted differently from project to project and that there is no noticeable advantage for either treatment across all projects. He indicated that in general, linguistics students do better in the skills of word recognition and spelling. This particular study showed no difference was found between reading rate, accuracy, or comprehension between the two programs.

A comparison of a linguistic approach and a basal reading approach was performed on first grade children during the second year of a three year investigation. The study showed that the two groups, when considered as a whole, were neither significantly higher in spelling or in reading achievement. The basal reader did score considerably higher in the total mean scores on four out of the fourteen criterion variables. In the remaining ten variables neither

group scored significantly higher than the other (Schneyer, 1967).

According to Durkin, more concern with linguistics than with reading was expressed in Fries' book, Linguistics and Reading (1962). Fries criticized all phonic programs and created his own method for developing children's vocabularies. His method dealt with whole words selected on the basis of spelling patterns. Words like "cat, fat, and mat" are introduced and practiced together as are other words that share a pattern, for example "can, fan, and man". His method, like his series, Merill Linguistic Readers is very similar to the Miami Linguistic Readers. Words that share a pattern, for example -at, are taught through structures and practiced together.

Since the research evidence indicates no reading achievment differences between typical basals and linguistics series, yet children are frustrated when they move from one to the other, a thorough study of the construction of the Miami Linguistic Readers and the Holt Reading Series is desirable to determine if indeed there are any differences in vocabulary load, word recognition, and comprehension between the series. Further investigation of the Miami Linguistic

Reading Series should be made to determine if any of the various reading areas need supplemental materials or activities in order to meet the readability levels, vocabulary loads, word recognition skills, or the variety of comprehension skills developed in the Holt Basic Reading Series . Such an investigation might show differences which could be remedied during linguistic instruction and provide the basis for avoiding frustration as the children move from one series to the other.

HYPOTHESIS

A study of the differences in the construction of the Miami Linguistic Readers and the Holt Basic Reading Series will be made to determine what needs to be done to insure students moving from one series to another will have no difficulties. It is hypothesized that there is no difference in vocabulary load in Miami Linguistic Readers and Holt Basic Reading Series, there is no difference in the word recognition process established by the two series, and that there is no difference in comprehension requirements of the two series.

DEFINITIONS

1. Bilingual Student - Student whose native tongue or language is other than English.

2. Miami Linguistic Readers - A linguistically-oriented reading and language arts program.

3. Holt Basic Reading Series - A conventional reading basal series.

4. E.S.L. - English as a Second Language.

5. Meaning-Emphasis - Believes that children should, and do, learn to read best when meaning is emphasized from the start.

6. Code Emphasis - Believes that the initial stage in reading instruction should emphasize teaching children to master a code-the alphabetic code.

ASSUMPTIONS

A comparison will be made between the Miami Linguistic Readers (grades 1-3) and the Holt Basic Reading Series (grades 1-3). Several assumptions which pertain to the

Miami Linguistic Readers are that it does not provide sufficient preparations in all areas of Reading and that supplementary reading materials, activities, and methods will be a solution to meeting the deficiencies experienced during the transition into the Holt Basic Reading Series.

LIMITATIONS

No attempt to validate the findings by assigning subjects to experimental and control groups and testing the outcome, i.e. reduction of frustration, etc. was planned for this study.

PROCEDURES

An analysis of the two series was made using the following criteria to determine if students would encounter difficulties when moving from one series to the other: vocabulary load, word recognition, and comprehension.

TABLE I summarizes the material to be used in this study.

TABLE I

SERIES USED IN THE COMPARISON OF READING SKILLS

MAIMI LINGUISTICS			HOLT BASIC READERS		
SERIES	GRADE	LEVEL	SERIES	GRADE	LEVEL
Readiness	K	Readiness Unit	About Me	K	Preprimer Level 1
Biff and Tiff	K	Preprimer Level 1-A	Hear, Say, See, Write!	K	Preprimer Level 2
Kid Kit and the Catfish	1	Preprimer Level 1-B	Rhymes and Tales	1	Preprimer Level 3
Nat the Rat	1	Preprimer Level 2	Books and Games	1	Preprimer Level 4
Tug Duck and Buzz Bug	1	Preprimer Level 3	Pets and People	1	Preprimer Level 5
The Sack Hut	1	Plateau (Levels 1-3)	Can You Imagine?	1	Primer Level 6
On the Rock in the Pond	1	Primer Level 4	A Place For Me	1	Primer Level 7
The Picnic Ship	1	Primer Level 5	A Time For Friends	1	Level 8
Hot Corn Muffins!	1	Primer Level 6	--	-	--
The Camping Trip	1	Plateau (Levels 4-6)	--	-	--
The Magic Bean	1	Level 7	--	-	--

Continued on next page

TABLE I (Continued)

SERIES USED IN THE COMPARISON OF READING SKILLS

MAIMI LINGUISTICS			HOLT BASIC READERS		
SERIES	GRADE	LEVEL	SERIES	GRADE	LEVEL
Chang's Shell	2	Level 8	People Need People	2	Level 9
Rumpelstillskin	2	Level 9	The Way of the World	2	Level 10
Dick's Cat	2	Plateau (Levels 7-9)	--	-	--
On Sunfish Island	2	Level 10	--	-	--
Mark's Jet	2	Level 11	--	-	--
Matt and the Black Cat	2	Level 12	--	-	--
B is for Bicycle	2	Plateau (Levels 10-12)	--	-	--
White Horse	2	Level 13	--	-	--
The Man on the Penny	2	Level 14	--	-	--
The Twin Mystery	2	Level 15	--	-	--
All Systems Go!	2	Plateau (Levels 13-15)	--	-	--
--	-	--	Never Give Up!	3	Level 11
--	-	--	Special Happenings	3	Level 12

Below is an explanation of the criteria examined in each of the series:

a. Vocabulary words were counted and compared in the linguistic and basal readers to determine the difference in the vocabulary load.

b. An analysis of phonic instruction procedures was made to determine the emphasis placed on word recognition and any differences found in the phonic methods used for teaching.

c. Comprehension was analyzed on the literal, interpretive, and critical levels of questioning.

d. Scope and Sequence Charts of the two series was examined to determine the order in which the reading skills are presented.

RESULTS

Although the Miami Linguistic Series was intended to be a two year program, the Elizabeth School district (New Jersey) sometimes has extended it as far as the fifth grade. For this comparison, it will be used as a three year program. Based on the research, the following is the data which resulted from a comparison between the Miami Linguistic Readers and the Holt Basic Reading Series:

The Holt Basic Reading Series placed a great emphasis on vocabulary instruction. The Holt Series is a typical conventional basal reader. It uses an analytic, sight(whole-word) approach to introduce its vocabulary. The sight words are first introduced in the Kindergarten, preprimer level 2 book.

Starting in the first grade, Holt presents their new vocabulary words in a section called Preparing to Read. New vocabulary words are put on cards, written on the board, and used in sentences. "Easily decoded" words are also reviewed. After the vocabulary words had been introduced, practiced, and reviewed, the students were ready for the reading selection. The same vocabulary was not only reinforced in

the workbook pages but was continuously being reviewed in the following sections of the teacher's manual: Vocabulary Development, Practice Exercises, Vocabulary Reinforcement, and Reading Skill Practice Sheets. This provides the students with the necessary background information required to succeed in comprehension.

Vocabulary in preprimer levels 2-5 increased at a gradual pace but changed to a more rapid pace in the primer levels 7-9. This rapid pace continued all through the third grade. Several first grade research studies have indicated that students become better readers at a faster rate when new words are presented to them at a faster pace.

The Miami Linguistic Readers used an analytic approach to introduce the vocabulary and linguistic approach for teaching it. A decoding manual was also used to provide additional practice with word families (For example, -at, -ap, -ab, etc.) and with contrasting vowel phonemes such as pick-peak and big-dig.

The vocabulary is very much structured and controlled. Bob Aukerman(1971) wrote in his book that the vocabulary in the Miami Linguistic Readers is extremely limited. Only seven words are introduced in the preprimer level 1-A and a slow increase in the vocabulary load continues throughout the remaining levels.

Table I, Vocabulary Load, indicates the number of words introduced in each Series at each grade level and in each book in the respective series. Although there are 20 books in the Miami Linguistic Readers through level 15 as compared to ten in the Holt Series, there is a greater vocabulary load in the Holt Series. The Holt Series had 1938 words while the Miami Readers had 998 words, resulting in a difference of 940 words.

Table II, Word Recognition, identifies the phonic programs in each of the series and what they provide from Kindergarten through third grade.

The Holt Series introduces all of its short vowels at the Kindergarten level. Short vowels such as ă in bat, ĕ in bed, ĭ in pig, ŏ in sock, and ŭ in cup are presented in initial and medial positions in the preprimer level 2 book, where as the Miami Readers only introduces the short ĭ at the Kindergarten preprimer level 1-A book. In the Miami Readers, the sequence of vowel sounds is structured and organized to emphasize one sound of one vowel for each level through level five of the first grade.

TABLE I

COMPARISON OF READING SKILLS - VOCABULARY LOAD

MIAMI LINGUISTICS			VOCABULARY LOAD		HOLT BASIC READERS			VOCABULARY LOAD	
SERIES	GRADE	LEVEL	INDIVIDUAL	CUMULATIVE	SERIES	GRADE	LEVEL	INDIVIDUAL	CUMULATIVE
Readiness	K	Readiness Unit	0	0	About Me	K	Preprimer Level 1	0	0
Biff and Tiff	K	Preprimer Level 1-A	7	7	Hear, Say, See, Write!	K	Preprimer Level 2	22	22
Kid Kit and the Catfish	1	Preprimer Level 1-B	16	23	Rhymes and Tales	1	Preprimer Level 3	24	46
Nat the Rat	1	Preprimer Level 2	24	47	Books and Games	1	Preprimer Level 4	37	83
Tug Duck and Buzz Bug	1	Preprimer Level 3	26	73	Pets and People	1	Preprimer Level 5	42	125
The Sack Hut	1	Plateau (Levels 1-3)	0	73	Can You Imagine?	1	Primer Level 6	26	151
On the Rock in the Pond	1	Primer Level 4	27	100	A Place For Me	1	Primer Level 7	182	333
The Picnic Ship	1	Primer Level 5	28	128	A Time For Friends	1	Level 8	262	595
Hot Corn Muffins!	1	Primer Level 6	31	159	--	-	--	0	595
The Camping Trip	1	Plateau (Levels 4-6)	6	165	--	-	--	0	595
The Magic Bean	1	Level 7	49	214	--	-	--	0	595
Chang's Shell	2	Level 8	53	267	People Need People	2	Level 9	550	1145
Rumpelstillskin	2	Level 9	57	324	The Way of the World	2	Level 10	181	1326
Dick's Cat	2	Plateau (Levels 7-9)	11	335	--	-	--	0	1326
On Sunfish Island	2	Level 10	71	406	--	-	--	0	1326
Mark's Jet	2	Level 11	79	485	--	-	--	0	1326
Matt and the Black Cat	2	Level 12	93	578	--	-	--	0	1326
B is for Bicycle	2	Plateau (Levels 10-12)	20	598	--	-	--	0	1326
White Horse	2	Level 13	97	695	--	-	--	0	1326
The Man on the Penny	2	Level 14	122	817	--	-	--	0	1326
The Twin Mystery	2	Level 15	115	932	--	-	--	0	1326
All Systems Go!	2	Plateau (Levels 13-15)	66	998	--	-	--	0	1326

(Continued on next page)

TABLE I (Continued)

COMPARISON OF READING SKILLS - VOCABULARY LOAD

MIAMI LINGUISTICS			VOCABULARY LOAD		HOLT BASIC READERS			VOCABULARY LOAD	
SERIES	GRADE	LEVEL	INDIVIDUAL	CUMULATIVE	SERIES	GRADE	LEVEL	INDIVIDUAL	CUMULATIVE
--	-	--	0	998	Never Give Up!	3	Level 11	304	1630
--	-	--	0	998	Special Happenings	3	Level 12	308	1938

TABLE II

COMPARISON OF READING SKILLS - WORD RECOGNITION

MIAMI LINGUISTICS			HOLT BASIC READERS		
GRADE	LEVEL	WORD RECOGNITION	GRADE	LEVEL	WORD RECOGNITION
K	Readiness Unit		K	Preprimer Level 1	----
K	Preprimer Level 1-A	Initial consonants: B-, T-, S-, s-, D-, d- Consonant combinations: dr-, Dr- Vowel-consonant combinations: -iff, -ink, -ing, -ig	K	Preprimer Level 2	Initial consonants with: -at,-an,-ap,-en,-ed,-elt,-ot, -op,-ob,-ock,-ill,-ig,-ib,-ift,-ud,-un,-ub,-ump Final consonants: /p/p as in soap, /d/d as in bird, /t/t as in nut, /n/n as in horn, /l/l as in girl, /m/m as in farm, /k/k as in hook, /s/s as in bus, /g/g as in rug, /r/r as in car, /f/f as in elf, /l/ll as in bell, /s/ss as in dress, /k/ck as in lock, /v/v as in five, /z/z as in prize, /ks/x as in ax Initial and medial vowels: /e/e as in egg and bed, /a/o as in octopus and sock, /i/i as in inch and pig, /ə/u as in up and cup
1	Preprimer Level 1-B	Initial consonants: K-, H-, F-, m-, t-, f- Initial consonant combinations: sl-, sp-, sw- Vowel-consonant combinations: -id, -im, -ill, -at, -ip, -ish, -ilk	1	Preprimer Level 3	Graphemic bases: -it,-in,-im,-ill,-ib,-ift Vowel sounds: /ay/ as in kite;/i/ as in pig
1	Preprimer Level 2	Initial consonants: C-, H-, N-, P-, R-, h-, K-, p-, r- Vowel-consonant combinations: -un, -iss, -ick, -ab, -ack, -ap	1	Preprimer Level 4	Graphemic bases: -ake,-an,-ick,-ack,-ike Vowel sounds: /ae/ as in bat; /ey/ as in cake
1	Preprimer Level 3	Initial consonants: b-, j- Consonant combinations: cl-, bl-, gr-, -mp, -nt, -zz Vowel-consonant combinations: -ug, -up, -ub, -ud, -un, -ut, -um, -ump, -uzz, -uck, -ix, -unt	1	Preprimer Level 5	Initial & final consonant: /s/sh Vowel sounds: /iy/ as in leaf:ea,ee; /e/ as in bed Final consonants: /f/ff; /g/gg/
1	Plateau (Levels 1-3)	----	1	Primer Level 6	Graphemic bases: -eat,-eal,-eam,-en,-et,-ell,-oat, -oad,-one,-ole,-ite,-ide,-ime,-ine,-ish,-ig, -ip Vowel sound: /ow/ as in goat:oa,o-e Vowel sounds: /a/ as in sock; /ow/ as in goat: oa,o-e
1	Primer Level 4	Consonant combinations: -st, -gs, -ns, -mps, -ts, -ps, -cks Vowel-consonant combinations: -ad, -am, -an, -ock, -od, -om, -on, -ond, -op, -ot, -ox, -ob	1	Primer Level 7	Initial consonants: /hw/wh; /s/sh; /c/ch; /θ/th; /ð/th Initial consonant blends: /br/br; /dr/dr; /gr/gr; /kr/cr; /fr/fr; /pr/pr; /tr/tr Final consonants: /s/sh; /c/ch; /θ/th; /ə/ng Consonant blends: /sl/sl; /pl/pl; /fl/fl Vowel sounds: /ow/ as in goat,note; /i/ as in pig; /ay/ as in kite; /a/ as in sock; /ə/ as in cup; /uw/ as in food:oo,u-e; /yuw/ as in cute; /ey/ as in cake:a-e,ai,ay; /ay/ as in kite:i-e,y; /ow/ as in goat:oa,o-e,ow; /iy/ as in leaf:ea,ee; /a/ as in sock Graphemic bases: -ar,-ark,-ard,-old Blends and diagraphs

(Continued on next page)

TABLE II (Continued)

COMPARISON OF READING SKILLS - WORD RECOGNITION

MIAMI LINGUISTICS			HOLT BASIC READERS		
GRADE	LEVEL	WORD RECOGNITION	GRADE	LEVEL	WORD RECOGNITION
1	Primer Level 5	Consonant combinations: tw-, tr-, fr-, sh-, tch- Vowel-consonant combinations: -ed, -et, -ant, -ell, -en, -es, -ic, -ag, -atch	1	Level 8	Vowel sounds: / y/ as in boil:oi,oy; /ow/ as in out:ou, ow; / r/ as in her: ir; /aw/ as in cow; /ow/ as in show; /iy/as in happy; /ar/ as in far; / r/ as in for Consonant blends: /sm/sm; /st/st; /sk/sc,sk; /sp/sp; /sl/sl; /sn/sn; /skr/scr; /skw/squ; /spr/spr; /str/str; /ðr/thr Initial, medial, & final consonants: /k/c; /s/c; /g/g; /j/g Word construction: graphemic bases a,e,o Syllabication: plural nouns
1	Primer Level 6	Consonant combinations: ch-, sm-, pl-, -dn't, -sn't, -lp, -rn Vowel-consonant combinations: -as, -us, -unk, -uff, -est, -elp, -orn, -ent Consonant-vowel combinations: -o, -e	-	--	----
1	Plateau (Levels 4-6)	----	-	--	----
1	Level 7	Vowel-consonant combination: -ast, -alk, -ean, -eat, -ead, -eam, -each, -old	-	--	----
2	Level 8	Initial consonant: l- Consonant combinations: wh- Vowel-consonant combination: -as, -and, -eet, -ere, -eep, -ang, -eak	2	Level 9	Final consonant blends: /ld/ld; /lf/lf; /lp/lp; /lt/lt; /nd/nd; /nt/nt; /nk/nk; /kt/ct; /ft/ft; /mp/mp Initial consonant: /r/wr Ending -ing: double consonant Word construction: graphemic base -ight Syllabication
2	Level 9	Vowel-consonant combination: -ay, -ace, -ake, -ame, -ave, -aw, -eap, -out, -oud, -ive, -ade, -een, -ound	2	Level 10	Vowel spellings for /ɔ/ as in tall:o,a,aw
2	Plateau (Levels 7-9)	----	-	--	----
2	Level 10	Vowel-consonant combinations: -ine, -end, -ide, -ight, -ear, -ook, -igh, -ome, -ike, -ar, -ate	-	--	----
2	Level 11	Vowel-consonant combinations: -oon, -all, -ile	-	--	----
2	Level 12	Vowel-consonant combinations: -oke, -ore	-	--	----
2	Plateau (Levels 10-12)	----	-	--	----

(Continued on next page)

TABLE II (Continued)

COMPARISON OF READING SKILLS - WORD RECOGNITION

MIAMI LINGUISTICS			HOLT BASIC READERS		
GRADE	LEVEL	WORD RECOGNITION	GRADE	LEVEL	WORD RECOGNITION
2	Level 13	Word Attack: white (what; like; ate), cloud (clean; loud), than (that; ran), cliff (cloud; Biff), brave (bring; cave) plan (plane; ran), always (all; ways), etc.	-	--	----
2	Level 14	Word Attack: gum (go; hum), peek (penny;week), wood (way; good), pan (pen; man), die (dig; tie), carry (can; marry), dog (do; fog), etc.	-	--	----
2	Level 15	Word Attack: trouble (context clues), mumble (context clues), discover (distance; cover), promised (context clues), dare (dark; glare),	-	--	----
2	Plateau (Levels 13-15)	----	-	--	----
3	--	----	3	Level 11	Homophones: our, hour, flower, flour Suffixes: -an, -ish, -ese, -ly, -ful, -less Irregular verbs
3	--	----	3	Level 12	Contractions: spellings Possesive nouns: spellings

The Miami Linguistic Readers are accompanied by a decoding manual for the teacher which is used in conjunction with the 21 reader books. The main reason for using the readers and the manual is to expose the students to the vowels which will appear in the next reader book. For example, if the students are presently reading the book, Kid Kit and the Catfish, the teacher should begin to teach them word-families of short ă from the decoding manual. This will prepare them for the next reader book, Nat the Rat. (Nat the Rat contains several short ă patterns such as -at, -ab, -ap, etc.). Another reason for the manual is to teach vowel phoneme pairs to its target audience: non-English speaking children and children who speak a range of nonstandard or divergent dialects. Examples of vowel phoneme pairs which can help students overcome possible consonant interference from their own sound system are sit-seat, slip-sleep, pick-peak, pig-pick, big-pig, and sinking-thinking.

The Holt Basic Reading Series introduce all long vowels in the first grade. The vowels are presented (one vowel per book) in preprimer books level 3-5 and primer books level 6-7. Unlike the Holt Series, the Miami Readers does not introduce the long vowels until level 7 - the last reader in grade one (Level 7 introduces the long vowel - ē). Although

the long vowels should be taught in the first grade, time constraints usually do not allow the teachers to teach level 7 until the second grade.

When comparing the vowel-consonant combinations, the Miami Readers places a stronger emphasis on the combinations than does the Holt Series. The Miami Readers begins slowly at the Kindergarten level with only four vowel-consonant combinations and increases to 62 by the first grade then drops to 36 by the end of the second grade. The large emphasis on vowel-consonant patterns is mainly due to one of the premises of the series: there is a strong probability that regularly spelled forms, especially when grouped by patterns, will be learned much faster than forms in which no system is apparent.

The Holt Series introduced the following vowel dipthongs in grade 1,levels 5-8: ee, ea, oa, oo, /ow/ as in blow, /ow/ as in cow, ou, oi, and oy. Dipthongs are not introduced until the second grade in the Miami Readers except for ea which is introduced at level 7 - the last reader in the first grade.

Holt Series introduced R-controlled vowels such as ar, er, ir, or, and ur in levels 7 & 8. Vowel sounds affected by w & l (/aw/ as in raw, /a/ as in tall) are presented in the second grade. The Miami Readers introduces the R-controlled

vowels (or) in the primer level 6 of the first grade. Some of the other R-controlled vowels are presented in the second grade. Vowels affected by w & l (/a/ as in tall) is presented at the end of the second grade.

Consonant combinations were mostly presented in the first grade in each of the respective series. The Miami readers stressed final consonant blends such as -nk, -mps, -nt, and -ps in the first grade (preprimer level 4) while the Holt Series did not introduce the same consonant combinations until the second grade (level 9).

The Holt Series placed a greater emphasis on final consonants (/p/ as in soap, /k/ as in hook) in the Kindergarten and first grade levels while the Miami Readers' main focus was on vocabulary-consonant combinations and consonant combinations. Also, the Holt Series covered initial consonants in the Kindergarten (preprimer level 1) and Miami Readers presented them in the first grade levels.

Table III, Structural Analysis, shows the differences and similarities between the two series in their presentation of language/writing skills.

The two series were similar in the presentation of varicus language/writing skills. Contractions, compounds, quotation marks, and capitalization are presented in the

TABLE III

COMPARISON OF READING SKILLS - STRUCTURAL ANALYSIS

MAIMI LINGUISTICS			HOLT BASIC READERS		
GRADE	LEVEL	STRUCTURAL ANALYSIS	GRADE	LEVEL	STRUCTURAL ANALYSIS
K	Readiness Unit	----	K	Preprimer Level 1	----
K	Preprimer Level 1-A	Common ending verb forms: -ing	K	Preprimer Level 2	----
1	Preprimer Level 1-B	----	1	Preprimer Level 3	Noun plurals Verb ending: -s
1	Preprimer Level 2	-'s (Genitive)	1	Preprimer Level 4	Capitalization Quotation marks
1	Preprimer Level 3	----	1	Preprimer Level 5	Capitalization: pronoun I Verb forms: -ed
1	Plateau (Levels 1-3)	----	1	Primer Level 6	Antonyms
1	Primer Level 4	-s (Third person)	1	Primer Level 7	Contractions: with not, is, I, -n't Possesive forms: -'s, Pronouns: he, she, we, they Compound words Verb forms: -ing, -ed Context clues Question word: when Verbs: -s Pronouns, verbs, & prepositional phrases Suffix: ly Sentence modifiers Ending -ing: after final e
1	Primer Level 5	-'s (Contraction) -'t (Contraction) -'m (Contraction)	1	Level 8	Quotation marks Sentence construction: nouns & verb phrases Homophones Questions: who, what, when, where, why Subject pronouns Plural forms: after y Verbs: is before -ing
1	Primer Level 6	-s (plural)	-	--	----
1	Plateau (Levels 4-6)	----	-	--	----
1	Level 7		-	--	----

(Continued on next page)

TABLE III (Continued)

COMPARISON OF READING SKILLS - STRUCTURAL ANALYSIS

MAIMI LINGUISTICS			HOLT BASIC READERS		
GRADE	LEVEL	STRUCTURAL ANALYSIS	GRADE	LEVEL	STRUCTURAL ANALYSIS
2	Level 8	-ed (Suffix ending) -'ll (contraction)	2	Level 9	Plural noun forms: irregular Compound sentences with and Ending -ing: double consonant Ending -er: agentive Objective pronouns
2	Level 9	----	2	Level 10	Plural possessive forms Literal and figurative meanings Analogies: synonyms & antonyms Homophones prefixes: en-, sub-, un- Prefixes and Suffixes
2	Plateau (Levels 7-9)	----	-	--	----
2	Level 10	-er (adjective)	-	--	----
2	Level 11	----	-	--	----
2	Level 12	-es (Plural) -ly (Adverb)	-	--	----
2	Plateau (Levels 10-12)	----	-	--	----
2	Level 13	-est (Superlative)	-	--	----
2	Level 14	-en (Past participle) -ness (to form nouns)	-	--	----
2	Level 15	----	-	--	----
2	Plateau (Levels 13-15)	----	-	--	----
-	--	----	3	Level 11	Commas: direct address Common abbreviations
-	--	----	3	Level 12	Object pronouns

first grade of both reading series. When comparing plural nouns, again both series presented them in the first grade; Holt Series at the beginning of the grade and Miami Readers at the end. The pronouns: I, he, she, we, and they, as well as the verb form: -ed, were also introduced to the students in the first grade.

Some differences in the two reading series are attributed to the way the skill was presented. For example, the Miami Linguistic Readers introduced the suffix: -ing with double consonants (sit - sitting) in the Kindergarten while the Holt Series waited until the second grade. This represents a major difference between the two series. Bob Aukerman (1971) commented that certain grammatical patterns, such as doubling of the letter "t" to make the word sitting, is an "abstract concept of grammar". He added that many linguists agree that this concept should be eliminated from the earlier learning stages. He was referring to the Miami Linguistic Readers.

Prefixes and suffixes were introduced at different levels in the two reading series. The Holt Reading Series introduced sub-, un-, and en- in the second grade, while the Miami Linguistic Series introduced only one prefix: un- in the third grade. Suffixes: -ly, -ful, -ness, -less, and -ish were all presented in the Holt Series in the third

grade. Only the suffixes -ly and -ness were introduced in the Miami Series at the third grade level.

Homophones, antonyms, and synonyms were all presented in grade one in the Holt Reading Series. None were introduced in the Miami Linguistic Readers.

As can be seen in Table IV, the Holt Basic Reading Series introduced the three levels of questioning (Nila B. Smith): literal, interpretive, and critical at level 3 of the first grade. The three levels of questioning were asked equally in this series.

The Holt Series not only provided adequate concept preparation before reading the selection, it also introduced the background information, new vocabulary, and concepts essential to comprehension. Concept preparation was provided through discussions about the illustrations and inferences to what might happen. The title of the story was also discussed before the students went on to read the story.

In the first grade, the stories in the Holt Series are about children and their experiences. The approach of having the stories draw on the students' everyday experiences, helps them with their comprehension. The student's understanding of the story and ease of reading will increase because the story builds on their schema.

TABLE IV

COMPARISON OF READING SKILLS - COMPREHENSION

MAIMI LINGUISTICS			HOLT BASIC READERS		
GRADE	LEVEL	COMPREHENSION	GRADE	LEVEL	COMPREHENSION
K	Readiness Unit		K	Preprimer Level 1	----
K	Preprimer Level 1-A	Recognizing & responding to word groups Recognizing & responding to sight words Classifying by perceiving relationships Drawing conclusions through observation of details Identifying important events in the narrative Identifying a sequence of events Associating personal experiences with events in the story Using analysis of spelling patterns as a clue to the reading of new words	K	Preprimer Level 2	Story telling from a picture Picture description Pictures of rhyming words Picture interpretation Matching pictures with phrases
1	Preprimer Level 1-B	Anticipating events Summarizing events Identifying cause-effect relationships Locating specific information	1	Preprimer Level 3	Characterization Multiple meanings Cause and effect Fact and opinion
1	Preprimer Level 2	Recalling events Identifying feelings and emotional reactions Identifying personal traits	1	Preprimer Level 4	Classification: supply heading Classification: comparing items Recalling details Main topic: pictured Main topic: stated
1	Preprimer Level 3	Identifying motives for action Comparing and contrasting	1	Preprimer Level 5	Inference Classification: headings given Setting Main idea: implied Analogies: picture association
1	Plateau (Levels 1-3)	----	1	Primer Level 6	----
1	Primer Level 4	Identifying the main idea of an episode Using analysis of word structure as a clue to the recognition of new words	1	Primer Level 7	Body language Classification: by function Multiple word meanings Analogies: word association Antonyms

(Continued on next page)

TABLE IV (Continued)

COMPARISON OF READING SKILLS - COMPREHENSION

MAIMI LINGUISTICS			HOLT BASIC READERS		
GRADE	LEVEL	COMPREHENSION	GRADE	LEVEL	COMPREHENSION
1	Primer Level 5	Identifying new meanings of familiar forms	1	Level 8	Theme Identifying main art figures Reacting to art Titles Point of view Poem
1	Primer Level 6	Using reference tools Using context clues Identifying characters, place, and time	-	--	----
1	Plateau (Levels 4-6)	----	-	--	----
1	Level 7	----	-	--	----
2	Level 8	----	2	Level 9	Context clues Identifying irrevelant sentences Prediction: identifying clues
2	Level 9	----	2	Level 10	Comparing sentence meaning Personification
2	Plateau (Levels 7-9)	----	-	--	----
2	Level 10	----	-	--	----
2	Level 11	----	-	--	----
2	Level 12	----	-	--	----
2	Plateau (Levels 10-12)	----	-	--	----
2	Level 13	----	-	--	----
2	Level 14	----	-	--	----
2	Level 15	----	-	--	----
2	Plateau (Levels 13-15)	----	-	--	----

(Continued on next page)

TABLE IV (Continued)

COMPARISON OF READING SKILLS - COMPREHENSION

MAIMI LINGUISTICS			HOLT BASIC READERS		
GRADE	LEVEL	COMPREHENSION	GRADE	LEVEL	COMPREHENSION
3	--	----	3	Level 11	Absurdities Reading a science story Historical fiction Comparing selections: main ideas; story details Cloze: context clues Folktales: purpose
3	--	----	3	Level 12	Sequence: time words Visual expression Artistic forms Conclusions Main idea: two paragraphs Sequence: ordering a list

In the second grade the stories become more diverse and branch out into areas about animals, planet earth, water and sky stories. The themes are interesting and motivating to the students.

In the third grade the stories deal more with the children's interests and experiences that they may have had. The selections are more mature and deal with real life occurrences, i.e. one story discusses the circus and another discusses the ballet.

The Holt Basic Reading Series is very thorough in the area of comprehension. In the Kindergarten, comprehension skills such as pictures of rhyming words, storytelling from pictures, and matching pictures with phrases are presented. To ensure comprehension in the first grade, the basal first provides an adequate vocabulary preparation in section 1 then continues into the 2nd section of the lesson - reading & comprehension. In this section, questions at the literal, inferential, and critical levels of thinking are asked concerning the pictures from the story and the title page. Students are then encouraged to read the selection. At the end of the selection there is a third section which reinforces comprehension: Developing and Applying Skills. For example, "recall the sequence of events in a selection"

was reinforced through a class activity. Other methods used in the first grade in developing comprehension skills are completing workbook pages, Reading skill practice sheets for review work (teachers make copies from their resource pack.), and extension exercises which are designed to meet the student's individual needs. The first grade also introduced a wide range of comprehension skills such as polysemantic words (ie. I am going to the park., I can park the car.), multiple meanings, and analogies. Idioms (ie. sick of, tired of) and figures of speech (ie. "it looks like rain", "the sky is falling") were introduced in the first grade.

The same format is continued into the second and third grades. In grade two, more attention was given to context clues, sentence meaning, personification, and prediction. A difference which could be found in the third grade was that the students after reading the story, are expected to write answers to the questions on the Reading Practice Skill Sheets. There are also questions at the end of each story (in their books) which can be answered orally or written. The third grade students move away from a primary level of comprehension and begin a pre-upper elementary level. Some areas of comprehension covered were: cloze: context clues, reading a science story, and selection comparison: main ideas, story details, and historical fiction.

The Miami Linguistic Readers, on the other hand, does not clearly define its objectives in the area of comprehension as does the Holt Series. They do not follow a sequential pattern for each grade level as found in the Holt Series. The teacher's manual does not include a section on comprehension or does it provide activities to reinforce comprehension skills. There is no mention of comprehension with the teaching of the Reading lessons in the manual.

There is only a Reading and Study Skill list on the back of the manual which gives you an indication of the skills taught in that particular book and previous books.

The Miami Linguistic Reader books are identified by levels and each set of three levels is followed by a "plateau" story. These plateau stories, with a reduced learning load, provides for guided reinforcement of patterns previously introduced.

In the first grade (levels one through three), students are taught to read by structures through the use of "Big Books" containing numerous pyramid exercises, or rhythm drills. Controlled practice of grammatical patterns are contained in both the student's reader books and the seatwork books (a workbook which reinforces the skills taught in that particular book level.). Since the lessons are taught in steps, it usually takes three to four steps

per day to teach a lesson. The manual briefly outlines the reading, writing, and language emphasis or skills that are to be taught in each of the steps. Each specific step has approximately 7 to 8 procedures which explain how to teach that particular step.

The stories in the program are divided into three groups. In the first group, the characters are all animals that behave like human beings. These stories provide a problem-solving scenario for the animals which can be relevant to the student's experiences. The stories in the second group are adaptations of folktales such as "Jack and the Beanstalk" and "Rumpelstiltskin". The third group represents stories that are of realistic nature. For example, there is a story about a boy and his bicycle, and another story about a brother and sister who try to solve a mystery about a missing ring.

First grade-level four to six books and the plateau book, The Camping Trip, provided additional oral, reading, and writing practice of the vocabulary, structure patterns, and a summary of the spelling patterns presented in the series. The seatwork book provided for skill building, word & sentence practice, testing, and additional attention to new vocabulary items. The activities that are provided for

the students in "The Camping Book" are designed to give the students reinforcement in understanding, speaking, reading, and writing the language content covered in the previously read stories.

Levels seven through nine and the plateau book, "Dick's Cat", increased the use of word attack skills as well as provided comprehension questions which could be written on the chalkboard for the students to read and answer orally. Long vowel sounds and syllabication were also introduced. The seatwork book emphasized the use of cloze:context clues. Questions in the literal level decreased as more questions in the interpretive and critical levels were asked. These questions pertained to cause-effect relationships and comparisons/contrasts. Students also began to anticipate and summarize events.

Levels ten to twelve including the plateau book, "B is for Bicycle", and levels thirteen through fifteen and the plateau book "All Systems Go", stopped using the "Big Books" and worked only with the student's reader books, seatwork books, and exercises provided in the teacher's manual. Skills focused on cloze:content clues, word and sentence completion, word attack, cause-effect relationship, anticipation, summarizing events, and the use of reference tools such as looking up table of contents. Presentation of

new vocabulary was also increased in the last two plateau books: "B is For Bicycle" introduced twenty new words and "All Systems Go" introduced sixty-six words.

In comparing the comprehension requirements of the two series, it was found that they both asked questions in the literal, interpretive, and critical levels of questioning. A difference was found with the Holt Series in that it did more in comprehension. The material covered many areas of comprehension that the Miami Linguistic Readers did not mention. For example, the Holt Series used the following: analogies-word association, antonyms, multiple meanings, characterization, personification, etc. while the Miami Readers stayed with one basic format and did not expand into these other areas.

Implications & Conclusion

In comparing the two respective series and the skills introduced in each of the grade levels in the four areas of reading: vocabulary, word recognition, structural analysis, and comprehension, the following conclusions were made:

In the area of vocabulary, as a result of the comparison, the hypothesis was incorrect. A difference was found in the vocabulary load between the two series. The

Holt Basic Reading Series introduced 1938 words by the end of the third grade and the Miami Linguistic Readers introduced 998 words at the end of the three year program.

As a result of the findings, the Miami Linguistic Series will have to be supplemented with the Dolch Sight Word List and/or the Harris Jacobson Core List for grades 1-3 to ensure a smooth transition into the basal program. An LEA approach could also be used to introduce the vocabulary from the Holt Series not covered in the Miami Readers.

In the area of word recognition, a difference was observed when specific skills were introduced. For example, in the Miami Linguistic Readers, students are not exposed to long vowels and dipthongs until the second grade. It is imperative that these word recognition skills be taught in the first grade because the students will need these skills for reading other first grade material and for taking achievement tests. Achievement tests such as the California Achievement Test are given to students each year during the month of April. It is suggested that when using the Miami Linguistic Readers, supplemental materials be used to teach and review these skill areas. Phonic skills workbooks should also be used to guarantee that the students receive a complete reading program.

In the area of structural analysis, as in the area of word recognition, some of the differences between the two series are attributed to the way the skills were presented. The Holt Reading Series introduced several suffixes and prefixes in the third grade while the Miami Readers only introduced one prefix and two suffixes in the third grade.

After reviewing the skills for structural analysis provided in the Miami Linguistic Readers, it appears necessary to provide the students with supplemental material which introduces the skills required at the different reading levels. Phonic skill workbooks are an excellent example of the type of supplemental materials which could be used.

The Miami Linguistic Readers did not clearly define its objectives in the area of comprehension, nor cover as many areas of comprehension skills (ie. analogies, antonyms, multiple meanings, etc.) as the Holt Series. The teacher's manual did not provide comprehension headings which would guide the teacher to comprehension-specific exercises or activities. The Miami Readers introduced and reviewed vocabulary, used them in sentences, and provided exercises to be done on the chalkboard. Also cloze:context clues were practiced in the seatwork books.

The Miami Linguistic Readers did not cover many of the areas of comprehension skills found in typical basals. It is suggested that students using this series need reinforcement utilizing other materials that introduce these particular areas of comprehension.

BASAL READERS: RELATED RESEARCH

RELATED RESEARCH

Research has shown that vocabulary instruction can develop greater comprehension (Beck, Perfetti, & McKeown, 1982). It has also been said that basal readers furnish the students with excellent opportunities for vocabulary development. It is believed that stories in the basals are filled with useful and interesting words which sometimes are not familiar to the student. Yet, Beck and McKeown (1987) argued that vocabulary instruction in basal readers is usually "brief and narrow", rarely going past establishing an association or providing a specific context. Therefore the student will not obtain the level of knowledge necessary for comprehension or to permit the words to become an immediate part of the his/her vocabulary. They also stated that the kind of word being targeted should determine the appropriate kind of instruction. For example, giving a student only a small amount of information about a word will sometimes activate the process of learning, making future encounters with the word an effective learning opportunity.

Sorenson's (1985) article is consistent with that of Beck and McKeown. Sorenson stated that a commom misconception in vocabulary instruction is that "mentioning of vocabulary words is sufficient for learning". As an example of this, she said that in a typical basal lesson, the teacher introduces a printed word and uses it in a sentence. The student then reads the word and is required to explain its meaning or use it in a sentence themselves. She emphasizes that in some basal manuals, this sequence follows a review exercise. This is very often where vocabulary teaching ends. Durkin (1978-79) considers this one-time-only presentation of vocabulary words "a dominant characteristic of classroom reading instruction".

Bliesmer and Yarborough (1965) compared ten different beginning reading programs in the first grade. These programs used various methods, ie. analytic vs. synthetic. The ten programs were broken down as follows:

- Ginn Basic Readers (1959), American Book (1963), and Scott Foresman Reading Program (1962) were of conventional basal reader type or as Jeanne Chall (1967, pg.134) called them, "moderate phonics or meaning - emphasis classification".

- Houghton Mifflin's Reading for Meaning Series (1963), Economy's Phonetic Keys to Reading, and Lippincott Basic Reading Program (1963) fall under the heading of "code - emphasis classification".

- Stern's Structural Reading Series, which is a linguistic program, was also examined.

- Two other programs used individual approaches; one used no commercially prepared material and the other used supplemental material, ie. word games, S.R.A. Reading Lab.

The first grade students registered in this program took the Stanford Achievement Test at the end of the first grade. The students that used the programs which had a heavier emphasis on code learning, phonics, and/or linguistics scored higher than those students using the conventional basal-reader programs, placing a greater emphasis on "meaningful reading" (Jeanne Chall, 1967, ibid pg.134).

The Economy Method was again compared to the Scott Foresman Method in another study performed in the Murphysboro Public Schools. The null hypothesis stated that the results in the reading achievement of second graders of using the Economy Method would not be different than that of second graders using the Scott Foresman Method. One hundred pairs of second grade students were correlated on mental age alone.

The students were given the California Test of Mental Maturity for mental age results and the California Achievement Test for reading achievement results. The tests were administered in April,1950 and April,1955. The students in the 1950 group had been taught by the Scott Foresman Method, while the 1955 group were taught using the Economy Method. When the results of the tests were analyzed, there was a significant difference between the two groups. The Economy Method produced higher reading achievement scores than the Scott Foresman Method (Kelly, 1958).

The Holt Basic Reading Series is considered a "conventional basal" (Chall, 1967). This series includes materials which introduce sight vocabulary, reading for meaning, context clues, sentence meaning, word recognition, and phonics/decoding skills. Dykstra (1968) made a similar basal category list when he compared four types of primary reading programs. The Holt Basic Reading Series is a typical basal reader which Chall (1967) calls in her book "conventional basal material".

A three year study of four different approaches to beginning reading was done in the New Castle Public School System, Pennsylvania. The four approaches were:

(1) A basal reader program using a "whole word" and accurately controlled vocabulary approach rendered by Scott & Foresman.

A three year study of four different approaches to beginning reading was done in the New Castle Public School System, Pennsylvania. The four approaches were:

(1) A basal reader program using a "whole word" and accurately controlled vocabulary approach rendered by Scott & Foresman.

(2) A phonics approach with a wide range of words represented by Lippincott.

(3) A combination of "whole word" plus phonics approach using the materials and methods of Scott Foresman. Also supplemented by Phonics and Word Power, a series of booklets by American Education Publication, Inc.

(4) Early to Read i/t/a Program, with a total language approach, a heavy vocabulary, and an initial teaching of the alphabet.

Results from this study indicated that:

a. Methods and materials, as well as the teachers themselves, are reflected in the students' results. Over 50% of the students achieved at least 1/2 grade above the predicted levels.

b. Students having intensive phonic approaches produced significantly better results in the Word Study Skills than those students using an eclectic basal reader.

c. Students introduced to reading through the i/t/a Merrill Program are not usually confused in the Spelling Area.

d. Basal reader programs should give serious consideration to increasing vocabulary and phonics in their beginning reading material (Hayes & Wuest, 1969).

Winch (1925) compared the effect of using a look-say and a synthetic sound-blending phonic approach in reading such sentences as "A fat cat sat on a mat.". He found that the phonics-trained children were superior to the look-say group. It appears to be that the direct teaching of letter sounds help the children read words which are controlled by common spelling patterns.

Prof. Helen F. O'Leary said that the most effective instructional program for achieving mastery of basic reading skills are the basal reading series. She also said that basal readers comprise of a series of graded readers in which the sequential aspects of reading growth are carefully planned for, analyzed, and recognized. In other words, the basal readers pace the student as his/her reading skills increase.

Nicholas Criscuolo (1964) explained how the basal readers teacher's manual helps guide the teacher in the development of the student's reading skills. The readers offer a sequential learning pattern which also helps in the student's reading development. The readers' stories are geared to capture the student's imagination and interest.

A study under a cooperative research program in Beginning Reading Instruction was performed at a first grade level at Syracuse University, New York. It consisted of comparing L.W.Singer's Structural Reading Series, Ginn Basic Reading Series, and Let's Play by Leonard Bloomfield and Clarence L. Barnhart. The results indicated that all three groups involved in the study read at acceptable levels, with no approach being superior to the other two. This study was extended into the second grade with similar results transpiring.

Research Studies on Linguistic Approaches

The Miami Linguistic Readers were originally developed to provide a breakthrough on the problem of teaching reading and language arts to children who are learning english as a

second language (Aukerman, 1971). It is a linguistically-oriented program with an emphasis on listening and speaking. The center of the language activities, according to Aukerman, is "on the acquisition of patterns" and the techniques used are "those of drill." The students read with grammatically-controlled structures and patterns by use of drills. "The objective is to help the child learn to understand, speak, read, and write standard English" (Aukerman, 1971).

One of the deficiencies with the Miami Linguistic Series appears to be a low vocabulary load. This series does not provide enough vocabulary development for the students. Aukerman (1971) states that the stories were constructed "with extremely limited vocabulary and controlled grammatical structure." For example, the first reader booklet, Biff and Tiff, uses only seven words.

Another limitation with the Miami Linguistic Series would appear to be the manner in which words are introduced. For instance, the verbs think, swim, and sit are expanded with the -ing ending. Aukerman (1971) mentioned that certain grammatical patterns, such as the doubling of the letter "t" to make the word sitting, is an "abstract concept of

grammar." Many linguists agree that this concept should be eliminated during the early learning stages.

According to Durkin, more concern with linguistics than with reading was expressed in Fries' book, Linguistics and Reading (1962). Fries criticized all phonic programs and created his own method for developing children's vocabularies. His method dealt with whole words selected on the basis of spelling patterns. Words like "cat, fat, and mat" are introduced and practiced together as are other words that share a pattern, for example "can, fan, and man". His method, like his series, Merill Linguistic Readers is very similar to the Miami Linguistic Readers. Words that share a pattern are for example -at are taught through structures and practiced together. Miami Linguistic's third reader booklet (Nat the Rat) contains many short "A" patterns i.e. -at, -ab, -ap, etc.

Dykstra (1968) compared a conventional basal, i.e. Ginn, Scott Foresman, to that of a linguistic program. He mentioned that basal and linguistic treatments are conducted differently from project to project and that there is no noticeable advantage for either treatment across all projects. He indicated that in general, linguistics students do better in the skills of word recognition and

spelling. This particular study showed no difference was found between reading rate, accuracy, or comprehension between the two programs.

MacKinnon (1959) also compared the effectiveness of a linguistic program with that of a conventional basal type reader. MacKinnon found that when five-year-olds, using conventional basal-readers, and given additional practice on the Gibson-Richards materials did better on recognition of words and sentences than those receiving additional practice on regular basal-reader materials.

MacKinnon's observation seems to indicate that language-pattern control of beginning reading materials is important variable to contend with, especially when there is little direct teacher instruction in learning new words.

A comparison of a linguistic approach and a basal reading approach was performed on first grade children during the second year of a three year investigation. The study showed that the two groups, when considered as a whole, were neither significantly higher in spelling or in reading achievement. The basal reader did score considerably higher in the total mean scores on four out of the fourteen

criterion variables. In the remaining ten variables neither group scored significantly higher than the other (Schneyer, 1967).

A 1961 article entitled "Actual and Expected Reading Achievement in Detroit" reported of a comparison between two fourth grade groups. The first group which was from the Dubuque School System (Iowa), used a composite basal method. The second group from Detriot, Michigan utilized a modified linguistic method in a addition to the composite basal method. In 1962, these two groups of students were tested, the results indicated that the fourth graders using the modified linguistic method exceeded the anticipated reading achievement level by at least one full year. These results were spread out across the slow learning children, the average and the bright.

The Detroit group followed Bloomfield's plan except for the use of some sight words prior to complete mastery of his regular words and syllable forms.

The four standardized tests used to evaluate the success of and/or inadequacies of the two reading methods were as follows:

1. Lorge - Thorndike Nonverbal Intelligence Test - determine the student's mental ability.

2. Bond, Clymer, Hoyt Silent Reading Diagnostic Tests - measured word recognition skills.

3. Gates Reading Survey - indicated speed, accuracy, vocabulary, and level of comprehension.

4. Bond, Clymer, Hoyt Developmental Reading Tests - provided the level of achievement in several specific comprehension abilities: factual reading to retain information, reading to organize, and reading to appreciate.

The two major results from this comparison were that the children using the modified linguistic method scored higher in most of the reading areas tested than the children using the composite basal method and the children with low and medium abilities benefited more than the students with high mental ability. Also, girls gained slightly more than boys from the modified linguistic method.

Sheldon, Stinson, and Peebles (1969) reported on a research project sponsored by the United States Office of Education. The purpose of this study was to determine the effectiveness of three methods of reading instruction. The three methods being examined were a basal reading program, a linguistic method, and modified linguistic approach. Sheldon, Stinson, and Peebles reported that at the end of two years instruction, all three methods were equally effective in teaching children to read. This study confirms the findings of the research of first grade studies that not one

of the three approaches is entirely successful in the teaching of reading to children. The teacher in the study was found to play as an important variable in determining the efficacy of any program of reading instruction.

CONCLUSION

The research studies presented in this research paper favor phonics/linguistic approaches for teaching reading skills.

When Bleismer & Yarborough compared ten reading programs in the first grade, they found that students using phonics/linguistics based programs scored higher reading scores.

It was reported that linguistic students did better in word recognition, spelling, and recognition of sentences. Also students under an intensive phonics approach demonstrated better results in Word Study skills.

Studies by Winch and Kelly indicated that students using a phonics program produced higher reading achievement scores than students using a basal type program.

Also, several of the basal studies indicated that basals needed a definite improvement in the area of vocabulary

instruction. Researchers such as Beck, McKeown, Sorenson, Durkin, and Wuest believe that most vocabulary instruction in basals is narrow and brief. This is due to not enough time spent on teaching vocabulary.

Finally, most research studies point to a phonic/linguistic approach as a beginning reading method. It suggests an integration of this approach with reading-for-meaning/conventional basal program.

REFERENCES

Aukerman, Robert. Approaches to Beginning Reading. John Wiley & Sons, Toronto, Canada, 1971.

Beck, Isabel L., McKeown, Margaret G. "Getting the Most from Basal Reading Selection," The Elementary School Journal, vol. 87, No. 3, pp. 347-354, January, 1987.

Bliesmer, Emery P., and Yarborough, Betty H. "A Comparison of Ten Different Beginning Reading Programs in First Grade," Phi Delta Kappan, vol. 56, pp. 500-504, 1965.

Chall, Jeanne. Learning to Read: The Great Debate. McGraw-Hill Book Company, New York, 1967.

Criscuolo, Nicholas. "Exploring the value of Basal Readers," Peabody Journal of Education, 42:98, September, 1964.

Durkin, Dolores. "Influences on Basal Reader Programs," The Elementary School Journal, vol. 87, pp. 331-336, 1987.

------: "What Classroom Observations Reveal About Reading Comprehension Insdtruction." Reading Research Quaterly, vol. 14, No. 4, pp. 481-533, 1978-79.

Dykstra, Robert. "Four Types of Primary Reading Programs: A Comparative Study," The National Elementary Principal, vol. 47, No. 5, pp. 50-56, April, 1968.

Fries, Charles C. Linguistics in Reading. Holt, Rinehart and Winston, Inc., New York, 1962.

Hayes, Robert B., and Wuest, Harry. "A Three Year Look at i.t.a., Lippincott, Phonics and Word Power, and Scott, Foresman," The Reading Teacher, vol. 22, No. 4, pp. 363-370, January, 1969.

Kelly, Barbara. "The Economy Method versus the Scott, Foresman Method in Teaching Second-Grade Reading in the Murphysboro Public Schools," Journal of Educational Research, vol. 51, pp. 465-469, February, 1958.

MacKinnon, A. R. "How do Children Learn to Read? An Experimental Investigation of Children's Early Growth in Awareness of the Meanings of Printed Symbols," The Copp Clark Publishing Co., Toronto, Canada, 1959.

O'Leary, Helen F. "Pressure the Basic Reading Program," Education, 84:12, September, 1963.

Schneyer, J. Wesley. "Reading Achievement of First Grade Children Taught by a Linguistic Approach and a Basal Reader Approach--Extended into Second Grade," The Reading Teacher, vol. 20, pp. 704-710, May, 1967.

Sheldon, William D. & Lashinger, Danald R., "Effect of First Grade Instruction Using Basal Readers, Modified Linguistic Materials, and Linguistic Readers," The Reading Teacher, 19:576, May, 1966.

------ and Nichols, Nancy J. "Effect of First Grade Instruction Using Basal Readers, Modified Linguistic Readers Materials and Linguistic Readers--Extended into Second Grade," The Reading Teacher, 20:720-725, May, 1967.

Sheldon, William D., Stinson, Franga, and Peebles, James D. "Comparison of Three Methods of Reading: A Continuation Study in the Third Grade," The Reading Teacher, 22:539-546, March, 1969.

Sister Mary Edward, P.B.V.M. "A Modified Linguistic Versus a Composite Basal Reading Program," The Reading Teacher, 17:512-515, 1964.

Sorenson, Nancy L. "Basal Reading Vocabulary Instruction: A Critique and Suggestions," The Reading Teacher, pp. 80-85, October-December, 1985.

Winch, W.H. "Teaching Beginners to Read in England: Its Methods , Results, and Psychological Bases," Journal of Educational Research Monographs.